

**R E V I E W**  
by  
**ATANAS KOVACHEV, Architect,**  
**Corresponding Member of the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, Professor, DSc,**  
**University of Forestry, Sofia,**  
**professional field 5.7. “Architecture, Construction, and Geodesy“**

**of the scientific body of works (artistic and creative output) for participation in a competition for attaining the academic position “Associate Professor” in professional field 5.7. “Architecture, Construction, and Geodesy” (High space in single-family residential buildings), announced in State Gazette No 87 of 19 October 2021, with candidate Chief Assistant Professor KLIMENT IVANOV, PhD, Architect.**

The review is made in my capacity as:

- Member of the Scientific jury, appointed by order 3-3K-63 of 02 February 2021 of the Rector of the New Bulgarian University, based on Resolution of the Academic Council 03 of 23 November 2021.
- Reviewer in the competition, appointed by resolution of the Scientific jury on its first meeting.

**I. Assessment for conformity with the national minimum requirements and the requirements of the New Bulgarian University**

In the competition for the academic position “Associate Professor” Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, presents scientific output after earning the educational and scientific degree “Doctor of Philosophy” (2014) and filling the academic position “Chief Assistant Professor” (2014). The dissertation is taken into account but is not reviewed in this competition. **The presented overall scientific, research, scholarly, academic, design, implementation, and expert output give the following outline:**

**Indicator A:** Dissertation paper for conferring the educational and scientific degree “Doctor of Philosophy” (defended) – **50 points (required – 50 points);**

**Indicator B:** Monograph – **100 points (required – 100 points);**

**Indicator Г:** Scientific publications in editions, which are referenced and indexed in world-famous scientific information databases, in non-referenced journals with scientific review or collective volumes – **350 points (required – 200 points);**

**Indicator Д:** Reviews for built or produced items of the author in specialised journals in the area of architecture and design, citations in monographs and collective volumes with scientific review, citations in non-referenced journals and others – **72 points (required – 50 points);**

**Indicator Ж:** – **150 points (required – 50 points);**

**Indicator 3: – 210 points (required – 70 points);**

**Indicator II: – 110 points (required – 50 points);**

**Indicators Б and 3 do not apply to the academic position “Associate Professor”.**

**The total number of points obtained with the presented output is 1 042 points out of required 570 points, which satisfy and exceed the minimum national requirements for all indicators for the scientific, research, scholarly, academic, artistic, and creative activities of the candidate for attaining the academic position “Associate Professor” in area: “Technical sciences”, professional field 5.7. “Architecture, Construction, and Geodesy”.**

## **II. Research (creative) activities and results**

### **1. Evaluation of the monographic work, creative activities or other publications, corresponding in volume and integrity to a monographic work, including an evaluation of the scientific and applied contributions of the author**

The **Monograph “High Living Room Space in Houses”** holds an important place among the body of scientific works of Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD. It is a research, studying the “high living room space” as a novel model for private residential space. It is regarded as an innovation in the development of the modern house. It is an alternative scheme, suitable for clients that look for a different organisation of life in their houses. The complex three-dimensional composition of the high space opens a new field for activity for the architectural designers – development of the residential space in elevation. The interior space becomes richer and impressive, without an increase in the built-up area. It opens new impressive exterior views and surprising interior angles. Indisputably, the monograph is of high quality and brings contributions to the area in question. For the purpose of education it will benefit both the university students and practicing architects.

The materials, presented for the competition, contain **2 articles** in editions, **referenced and indexed in world-famous scientific information databases**. Regarding the second article – **“Imitation as a Method of Intervention in Existing Buildings”** from 2016, the reviewer established that a technical error has been made – the conference proceedings have not been referenced in world-famous scientific information databases at the time of the publication (the next conference proceedings “Old Art module” were referenced in 2017). Therefore the article has to be moved to the second group (non-referenced journals ...) and the overall number of points has to be reduced by 20.

The presented materials include **3 articles** in **non-referenced journals or collective volumes with scientific review** (namely “Collection of Scientific Publications, Departments

Architecture, Design, and Fine Arts” of the New Bulgarian University). These are: “*The “Modern Ruins” Phenomenon*”, “*Architectural Interventions in the Adaptive Reuse of Buildings*”, and “*Architectural Interventions in Roof Spaces*”. The article from the previous group has to be added here and their number will be **4**.

The presented **scientific publications correspond** to the profile of the scientific research of Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, and are related to the professional field and the scientific specialty of the candidate in the competition. His works present him as a researcher and prove his knowledge of the theory and practice in the field of the research. In them he demonstrates the ability to analyse problems, to make summaries and conclusions with scientific and applied contributions that can be used in the scientific, research, design, and implementation activities of the author, as well as by other practitioners.

The candidate has delivered public lectures on behalf of the New Bulgarian University at the invitation of prestigious national and international organizations, presented in the materials for the competition.

Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, has taken part as a member of the research team in the scientific research project: “Three-dimensional survey, virtual reconstruction, and online exhibition of prominent monuments of residential architecture in Bulgaria in support of their physical and social adaptation in the urban and natural context”, funded by the Bulgarian National Science Fund.

## **2. Evaluation of the contributions in the other presented publications (creative activities) made after the attaining of the academic position “Chief Assistant Professor”**

The presented materials include **6 Reviews for built or in-production author's products** (investment projects and industrial design products) in specialized editions in the field of architecture or design – in Bulgarian magazines: “Beautiful HOUSES” – 3 Reviews; “More about the HOUSE” – 1 Review; “Ideal HOME” – 1 Review; “MD Magazine” – 1 Review, and in a foreign magazine: “House Beautiful Turkey” – 1 Review.

The opinion of the reviewer regarding the **CONTRIBUTIONS** is that with his scientific output Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, conducts research that has contributions of both scientific and applied nature.

### **SUMMARY: The nature of his scientific contributions can be attributed to:**

- enriching the existing knowledge by obtaining confirmatory facts, as well as obtaining and proving existing facts and problems with new means;

- application of scientific achievements by implementing the results in the architectural practice and in the educational activity – in lectures and design-studios.

### **3. Citation by other authors**

The materials for the competition contain a Reference for citations of scientific publications of Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, by other authors in scientific journals, and it shows one citation found!

### **4. Evaluation of the results of participation in research and creative projects, and application of the obtained results in practice**

The creative activities of Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, are the result of a successful **architectural practice**. The candidate maintains his registration with the Chamber of Architects in Bulgaria as a member with **Full Range of Services**. The body of his works as an architectural designer refers to various areas of urban planning and architectural design. The materials for the competition contain investment projects for **public buildings, residential buildings, and interior design**, including also **product design** items. Some of the assignments have been won at National and International Competitions. They have been awarded First Prizes in competitions with a very high number of participants. This demonstrates the wide typological range of the designed buildings and items, and the high-ranking results achieved. It is worth noting that the candidate has more than 15 architectural and design projects published at home and abroad.

## **III. Scholarly and academic activities**

### **1. Auditorium and extracurricular employment, work in the electronic training module “MOODLE – NBU”, provision of practice and internships for students, work with students and PhD students**

Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, takes active part in the academic process. He has worked on several external (from the National Evaluation and Accreditation Agency) and internal accreditations of the Master’s Programme in Architecture and the Doctoral Programme “Architecture of Buildings, Structures, Facilities, and Details” of the New Bulgarian University. He has created two completely new academic courses: ARCM271 Computer Architectural Design Part I and ARCM275 Computer Architectural Design Part II.

He has also initiated and participated in the creation of the new academic courses: ARCM270 Computer Architectural Graphics Part I, ARCM273 Computer Architectural Graphics Part II, OOOK230 Fundamentals of Architecture, and ARCM169 Exercise: Com-

puter Architectural Design Part IV. He has created new design briefs for all the academic courses that he lectures or leads.

From the presented Personal forms for reporting and evaluation of the candidate's academic work it is clear that for the **last completed 2020-21 academic year** he fulfils the annual norm for the academic position “Chief Assistant Professor” of 240 auditorium and 60 extracurricular hours (**he had 340 auditorium and 100 extracurricular hours for the specified school year, or with 140 hours more**). During the last 5 academic years (from 2016-17 to 2020-21) Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, has always exceeded the norm for his academic position at New Bulgarian University.

In the 2020-21 academic year he lectured or lead the following courses (lectures and design studios): **Auditorium:** ARCM019 Residential Buildings and Compounds Part I; ARCM267 Architecture of Buildings and Estates II; ARCM295 Specialized Zones (Business Parks and others); ARCM096 Architecture of Buildings and Estates – Diploma Project Design Studio; ARCM325 Design Studio: Pre-Diploma Project I; ARCM084 Design Studio: Pre-Diploma Project II – Architecture of Buildings and Estates; ARCM163 Design Studio: Residential Buildings and Compounds Part I; ARCM284 Design Studio: Residential Buildings and Compounds Part II; ARCM297 Design Studio: Specialized Zones (Business Parks and others). **Extracurricular:** ARCM302 Project: Pre-Diploma Project I; ARCM419 Project: Residential Buildings and Compounds Part II; ARCM293 Project: Specialized Zones (Business Parks and others).

As a long-time lecturer in computer modelling, Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, actively uses the electronic training module “MOODLE – NBU” for all courses led by him. There he provides: design briefs (in the form of text, drawings, photos, and graphics), assignments for work in specialized electronic formats (CAD and BIM), legislation norms and regulations, etc.

In terms of provision of practice and internships for students, the candidate for the competition had been an Academic Mentor under the Operational Program “Students’ Practices” for 3 years: 2013, 2014, and 2017. Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, has supervised 11 successfully defended graduates. The presented materials show a large variety of topics for the diploma projects that demonstrate a high level of the involvement of the candidate. He has also been a reviewer of 18 diploma projects.

He has been actively involved both as an organizer and a leader in the preparation and participation of students in creative venues outside the New Bulgarian University, such as The International Competitions for Students of Architecture “Multi-Comfort House” in Turkey

(2014), Kazakhstan (2015), Spain (2017), Dubai 2018), and France (2020), as well as in the World Triennial of Architecture “INTERARCH” (2018). In these forums, the NBU students have performed successfully, winning prizes and receiving prestigious awards. This activity of the candidate in the competition can be highly appreciated. This shows that Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, is an active participant in the academic activities of the Department of Architecture of the New Bulgarian University.

## **2. Working with Erasmus students**

Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, has always worked with students from the “Erasmus+” Programme both in his capacity as Programme Consultant and as a supervisor of students’ design studio academic projects. He works both with foreign students (from Spain, USA, Sweden, etc.) and Bulgarian students who have studied or worked in other countries (UK, Germany, Spain, Netherlands, Turkey, etc.).

## **3. Score from student’s inquiries**

The average score from the satisfaction inquiries of students per course and lecturer according to the requirements of NBU should be over 4.00. From the presented documents is evident that Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, has an average score of 4.51.

# **IV. Administrative and social activities**

## **1. Social activities**

The social activities of Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, are marked by his position as an External Expert of the Commission for Spatial Planning, Architecture, and Housing Policy at the Sofia Municipal Council for two years.

## **2. Enlisting students in the programme**

Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, actively participates in activities to promote and enlist new students in the programme.

At his administrative position as Programme Consultant he is responsible for prospective students and the students from the first to the third grade. He has organized and participated in many “Open Days” at the New Bulgarian University.

# **V. Personal impressions of the candidate (if any)**

Until my appointment as a member of the Scientific Jury and my election as a Reviewer in the competition for the academic position “Associate Professor”, I had not known Kliment Ivanov personally. My work on the Review put me in touch with the candidate in the competition. I believe that he is a well-prepared and intelligent colleague with a high potential for work in every area – scholarly, academic, scientific, research, design, and implementation.

I highly appreciate the fact that he is a practicing architect with a presence in the architectural life and is known to the architectural community for his designs and built projects. It is my belief that a university professor, leading design studios (such as “Residential Building Design”), must design and build investment projects in the real practice, in order to have the confidence that he is familiar with the long and complicated path from the initial idea to the final realization, and to demonstrate to the students what he does himself. Students unmistakably recognise the one who has the experience, who can recount and show them his own successes and mistakes – it is the real architectural practice that distinguishes him from the one who just teaches memorized phrases.

## **VI. Opinions, remarks, and recommendations on the activities and achievements of the candidate**

**Opinions:** The opinion of the reviewer regarding the **PERSONAL CONTRIBUTION of the CANDIDATE** is that the publications of Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, have been developed autonomously, which shows that they are the personal work of the candidate. The monograph, also developed autonomously, is a personal contribution of the candidate and is important in the study of a topical issue in the architectural practice.

**Critical observations:** In my view, a relatively modest part of the work of the candidate at the present stage is **the recognition of his scientific publications in the scientific literature worldwide – known citations** of his monographs, books, articles, and research projects. The reasons for this are clear – publication in renowned foreign journals involves active and serious work, and requires a lot of time for the procedure.

**Recommendations:** My **recommendation** to Chief Assist. Prof. Kliment Ivanov, PhD, is to continue in his future work the development and publication of **scientific articles and studies at home and abroad in journals with Impact Factor and in referenced and indexed world-famous scientific journals, especially those included in “world-famous scientific information databases”, where just one autonomous publication in a journal with Impact Factor provides the author with 40 points**, as well as in **“monographs and collective volumes with scientific review”!** The collection of a minimum number of points according to certain criteria is a prerequisite for the registration of the scientists in the National Centre for Information and Documentation (NACID) and an opportunity for their participation in scientific juries under the Law on the Development of Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria. Increasing the candidate's scientific output in quantitative terms and the publication of materials in renowned scientific journals will contribute toward greater citation in both

the Bulgarian and foreign scientific literature, which will bring him recognition as a scientist with positions in the professional field of his area of expertise.

## **CONCLUSION**

The competition complies with the requirements of the Law on the Development of Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria, the Rules of Procedure for it, and the regulations of the New Bulgarian University in terms of its announcement and the submitted materials. The scientific, research, scholarly, academic, design, and implementation activities of the candidate in the competition – Chief Assist. Prof. KLIMENT IVANOV, PhD, comply with the requirements of the above laws and the regulations in this area.

The minimum national requirements for the scientific, academic, artistic, and creative activities of the candidate in the competition for the academic position “**Associate Professor**” in area 5. “**Technical sciences**”, professional field 5.7. “**Architecture, Construction, and Geodesy**” (Minimum number of required points by groups of indicators for different scientific degrees and academic positions, and number of points achieved according to the indicators) are fulfilled. The candidate in the competition, Chief Assist. Prof. KLIMENT IVANOV, PhD, presents a body of scientific works that exceed the minimum requirements.

**Based on the above analysis, I give a positive assessment of the academic activities of Chief Assist. Prof. KLIMENT IVANOV, PhD.**

**I propose him to be admitted to the election by the Academic Council of the New Bulgarian University and attain the academic position “ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR” in area: 5. “Technical sciences”, professional field 5.7. “Architecture, Construction, and Geodesy”.**

**Reviewer:**

.....  
(ATANAS KOVACHEV, Architect,

Corresponding Member of the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, Professor, DSc,

Foreign member of the Russian Academy of Architecture and Construction Sciences)

Sofia, 6 February 2022